



International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination

Distr.: General
16 August 2016

Original: English

Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination Ninetieth session

Summary record of the 2465th meeting

Held at the Palais Wilson, Geneva, on Friday, 12 August 2016, at 10 a.m.

Chair: Mr. Amir (Vice-Chair)
later: Ms. Crickley (Chair)

Contents

Consideration of reports, comments and information submitted by States parties under article 9 of the Convention (*continued*)

Combined twenty-second and twenty-third reports of Ukraine (continued)

This record is subject to correction.

Corrections should be submitted in one of the working languages. They should be set forth in a memorandum and also incorporated in a copy of the record. They should be sent *within one week of the date of the present document* to the English Translation Section, room E.6040, Palais des Nations, Geneva (trad_sec_eng@unog.ch).

Any corrections to the records of the public meetings of the Committee at this session will be consolidated in a single corrigendum, to be issued shortly after the end of the session.

GE.16-14080 (E) 160816 160816



* 1 6 1 4 0 8 0 *

Please recycle A small graphic of a recycling symbol, consisting of three chasing arrows forming a triangle.



In the absence of Ms. Crickley (Chair), Mr. Amir (Vice-Chair) took the Chair.

The meeting was called to order at 10.05 a.m.

Combined twenty-second and twenty-third periodic reports of Ukraine (continued)
(CERD/C/UKR/22-23, HRI/CORE/1/Add.63/Rev. and CERD/C/UKR/Q/22-23)

1. *At the invitation of the Chair, the delegation of Ukraine took places at the Committee table.*
2. **Ms. Mazur** (Ukraine) said that some of the issues discussed during the previous meeting required clarification. The change in power in Ukraine had not been brought about by street protests, but by a revolution of dignity. The claim that the revolution had increased tensions between the eastern and western regions of the country was untrue. Nor had it led to discrimination. The tensions between eastern and western Ukraine were caused by the illegal occupation of sovereign territory by a third country. Crimea had not separated from Ukraine as a result of the conflict in the Donbas; it had been annexed by the Russian Federation. Since the occupation of part of Ukraine's territory, there had been a rise in discrimination against Crimean Tatars and other groups supporting the Ukrainian Government's cause. The authorities of occupied Crimea had banned the Mejlis (parliament) of the Crimean Tatar people and committed serious violations of their human rights, including the disappearance of 16 and murder of 11 Crimean Tatars.
3. The occupation had also led to conflict in the south-east of the country. Replying to a question about the crossing of the demarcation line in the Donbas, she said that the Ukrainian authorities respected the rights of all persons, regardless of whether they lived on government- or rebel-controlled territory. Claims that 30 persons had been killed at checkpoints were baseless and she urged the Committee to draw on more reliable sources of information. Ukraine fully complied with its obligations under international treaties and the Minsk Protocol and Agreement and refrained from the use of heavy artillery. Any shelling came from the rebel-held areas. Unlike the Russian Federation, Ukraine had ratified the Convention on the Prohibition of the Use, Stockpiling, Production and Transfer of Anti-Personnel Mines and on Their Destruction, so that any casualties from anti-personnel mines were attributable to the separatists or the authorities in the Donbas.
4. The late submission of the report had been due to extraordinary circumstances and the effort to include broader, up-to-date information. In future, reports would be submitted on time.
5. A set of measures had been implemented to protect minorities. However, the "hybrid war" going on in the country and military aggression involving the use of terrorist groups and mercenaries hampered the protection of human rights, including in the territory under temporary occupation. The responsibility for protecting human rights in those areas rested with the occupying power.
6. **Mr. Tarasenko** (Ukraine) said that article 161 of the Criminal Code established liability for offences motivated by racial, nationality-based or religious intolerance. Between 1 January 2014 and July 2016, 112 criminal cases had been brought under the article. In the past, the main difficulty in applying the article had been the necessity to prove xenophobic intention. In order to address that problem, procedures for submitting complaints of discrimination had been changed. Henceforth, it was sufficient for the complainant to state that he or she believed that the offence had been motivated by racism or xenophobia; that statement was then reflected in the record. Complaints of discrimination-motivated crimes were investigated thoroughly and impartially. In order to protect complainants from discrimination based on their nationality, the question on nationality had been removed from the forms.

7. A human rights monitoring department had been set up within the national police. The department was competent to receive complaints of discrimination by police officers, including from detainees. All members of the police force were required to attend human rights training courses, including on non-discrimination, that were conducted with the participation of international organizations such as the International Organization for Migration (IOM). In order to prevent discrimination, posters had been prepared for display in government offices and hospitals to raise awareness of its dangers. A handbook was currently being drafted to inform victims of discrimination of their rights, which would be published in at least 10 languages. Posters displaying the rights of detainees in 10 languages were on display in pretrial detention facilities.

8. In order to prevent violence in the context of football events, the police held meetings with football supporters' associations prior to matches; in addition, fans were searched at the entrance to prevent them from bringing provocative banners into the stadium. The violent events during the Dynamo Kiev versus Chelsea match in October 2015 had been investigated and the person responsible for starting the fight had been sentenced to 2 years' imprisonment with 1 year of probation.

9. Referring to an incident involving a black refugee woman from Sierra Leone who had been taken off a bus in the town of Uzhgorod in 2015, he said that the woman had been asked to leave the bus because she had refused to pay the fare, not because of her skin colour. After the incident had come to the attention of the police, it had been reviewed closely. The woman had been unaware that, as a refugee, she was entitled to financial assistance. She had been awarded 20,000 hryvnia and other forms of assistance available for refugees. Her 10-month-old son had been granted Ukrainian citizenship. The incident in which students had been denied access to an aqua-park in the summer of 2015 had not been investigated, because the students had neglected to file a complaint.

10. Since 1 January 2014, 25 criminal investigations had been instituted in connection with the conflict between the two Eastern Orthodox Christian populations, with respective loyalties to the Moscow or Kiev patriarchs. Police investigations into such incidents were impartial and did not discriminate against members of either religious group. Furthermore, thanks to outstanding police work, the celebration of the anniversary of the introduction of Christianity in Russia had taken place without any disturbances. Ukraine was home to many religions and the police did its utmost to protect the rights of all.

11. The police was currently investigating 116 crimes against indigenous Crimean Tatars committed in Crimea; the charges included disappearance and murder for expressing pro-Ukrainian views, deprivation of liberty, torture and 27 cases where Tatar journalists had been prevented from carrying out their professional activities. The occupying authorities had also taken steps to ban the Mejlis.

12. **Mr. Syniavskiy** (Ukraine) said that the Ukrainian Law on refugees and persons in need of complementary or temporary protection drew on the Convention relating to the Status of Refugees, the Protocol Relating to the Status of Refugees and relevant European Union legislation. It provided for the protection of foreigners and stateless persons, set forth legal definitions, established the rules for asylum procedures, and contained provisions on refugees' access to the labour market, health, education and social services. In 2014, amendments had been introduced that broadened the definition of persons requiring complementary protection to include stateless persons and persons fleeing from internal or international conflict. In order to improve the asylum procedure, the Ministry of Internal Affairs had issued Order No. 649 of 2011 approving regulations for the consideration of applications and completion of the documents required to request recognition as a refugee or a person in need of subsidiary protection.

13. During 2015, 1,433 foreigners and stateless persons had applied for asylum in Ukraine. In 49 cases refugee status had been granted and 118 persons had been recognized as eligible for subsidiary protection. Currently, there were some 2,500 registered refugees and 600 persons eligible for subsidiary protection in Ukraine. Most asylum seekers came from Afghanistan, Syria and the Russian Federation. In 2013, a joint project of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) and the Ukrainian migration authorities had been launched as part of the Asylum Systems Quality Initiative in Eastern Europe and South Caucasus, which aimed at improving asylum procedures and refugee protection. Training sessions had been conducted for representatives of the State Migration Service in Kiev and the territorial offices. As of 2015, UNHCR partner organizations had conducted 15 seminars for staff of the territorial divisions of the State Migration Service. In 2013, Ukraine had ratified the Convention relating to the Status of Stateless Persons and the Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness. The State Migration Service had proposed amendments to the Law on the Legal Status of Foreigners and Stateless Persons in order to address problems faced by stateless persons, most of whom were young people who had entered Ukraine as foreign nationals and did not hold the 1974 version of the Soviet Union passport, but instead had been registered as offspring of their parents. The proposed amendments would address that problem.

14. In response to questions regarding the difficulties foreigners allegedly faced when crossing the border between Ukraine and the Autonomous Republic of Crimea, he said that the Cabinet of Ministers had adopted a regulation on entry and exit to and from the temporarily occupied territory of Ukraine, which allowed, among others, for the free entry and exit of foreigners. He was unaware of any problems in that regard.

15. In response to questions about interpretation and translation for foreigners, he said that Ukrainian was the official language. However, if foreign nationals needed to file an application or complaint in a foreign language, translation and interpretation were available. As of 2015, a portion of the State budget was earmarked for such services, which were provided free of charge. Records of proceedings were also presented in the applicant's own language.

16. **Ms. Onyshchenko** (Ukraine), in response to previous comments regarding restrictions on working for the State and on becoming a judge in Ukraine, said that since the adoption of its Constitution in 1996, Ukraine had upheld the equal rights of all citizens to enter public service. As a result, all citizens, regardless of nationality, were able to participate in the management of public affairs, and Ukraine had never experienced problems with discrimination in this regard.

17. Under Ukrainian law on the prevention of discrimination, people who believed that they had been subjected to discrimination could complain to State bodies, including the parliamentary ombudsman and the courts. As to the question of possible confusion over whom such individuals should address, there was no comprehensive list since the law provided ample possibility for them to protect their rights. For example, a person believing that a representative of government authority had infringed his or her rights could address the superior of that representative. Different State bodies had different complaints procedures, failing which there was a separate law covering complaints by citizens, so that they had ample opportunity to defend their rights.

18. On the question of individuals' knowledge of whom to approach, she said that the Ministry of Justice provided free legal assistance to citizens, in accordance with the Constitution, which benefited those who did not have a high level of education or the means to hire a lawyer. As of July 2015, Ukraine had 100 centres providing free legal, civil and administrative assistance to disadvantaged population groups, regardless of ethnicity or other factors. A further 566 mobile units provided consultations, while about 5,000 lawyers were involved in the work throughout Ukraine and were in a position to assist 8 million

people. Between July 2015 and July 2016, those centres had received more than 105,000 requests for information, had taken more than 20,000 decisions on providing counsel for court proceedings, and had referred more than 20,000 individuals to other organizations for assistance.

19. **Mr. Kononenko** (Ukraine), in response to the question concerning the education of Roma children, said that the State had carried out statistical work to determine how many children were failing to receive the mandatory general education guaranteed by the Constitution. In 2015, there were 21,487 children aged 6 to 18 not in school (0.5 per cent of the total). It was thought that some of those children would be Roma, but since statistics were not collected on the basis of nationality, their exact number was unknown. The democratic evolution in Ukraine in recent years had ensured that practically every school had places available for children, meaning that the problem related to the socially disadvantaged situation of Roma families, rather than availability. Schools did not impose formal documentary requirements, since all children should attend school regardless of whether or not they had a birth certificate, for example. The children of internally displaced persons were also covered by the education system, since they could commence their education under a special procedure in the absence of formal documents. Local authorities paid special attention to cooperation with Roma NGOs and Roma mediators under a system that had achieved some success in providing assistance to schools and teachers. Each year, the Ministry of Education and Science held a well-attended seminar with the full involvement of Roma organizations, which allowed the authorities to address their concerns and their problems, and which contributed to ensuring maximum school attendance. Ministry representatives also visited Roma communities to hold daily meetings with parents and children, which gave them the opportunity to identify children who did not attend school and eventually to remedy the situation. Psychological and social support was provided to Roma families through school psychologists and specialized teachers. Ukraine also invested in motivational and preparatory work to ensure that children were ready for schooling and to focus on areas where they might be lacking in skills. Ukraine had developed special educational programmes in the Roma language, on Roma culture and traditions, and on the Roma holocaust. It also provided vocational training courses in all areas with Roma populations. In respect of the question on the Roma and the Ukrainian language, there were few problems, although special measures and support had been implemented for the study of Ukrainian among the Hungarian-speaking Roma of the Zakarpattia region. The study of Ukrainian had been mandatory since 1993.

20. Special attention was given to human rights education, non-discrimination and the promotion of tolerance as part of the State educational standard. For several years, an anti-discriminatory review had been carried out as part of the preparation of school textbooks. All schools taught compulsory courses related to basic knowledge of the law, including anti-discrimination issues, which were also covered in subjects such as history and literature. Schools provided some non-compulsory courses on human rights. In 2005, with the cooperation of the High Commissioner on National Minorities of the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe, Ukraine had introduced a course on good neighbourly relations, aimed at the promotion and study of the languages, cultures and ethnography of persons of different nationality living in various parts of the country. Special manuals and working papers had been distributed to parts of the country with many nationalities. In the past three years, Ukraine had focused on multilingual education, which had been highly successful in other countries. The work carried out on human rights and non-discrimination in the area of education had led to a sharp reduction in crimes related to those issues, according to information provided by the police.

21. He said that he believed that the Committee had received incorrect information on the question of Russian schools, which did not exist in the Zakarpattia region. The Russians had tried to create such schools, but the initiative had not succeeded owing to internal

reasons. The Ukrainian State supported the realization of opportunities, and the Constitution guaranteed the right of citizens to speak and study in their own national language. Moreover, Ukraine had ratified international instruments on such questions, and would therefore support such initiatives. The traditions, folklore and specific features of various subethnic groups were studied in Zakarpattia and other parts of the country.

22. In response to the question concerning the language of instruction in universities, he said that Ukrainian universities, in addition to using the official language, provided courses in Hungarian, Romanian and Russian. A 2004 law had given greater autonomy to universities, which could deliver courses in the language of their choice and had recently tended to focus on English, French and German. More than 40 languages were taught in higher education institutions. At the preschool level, pupils were taught in nine languages, including German, Greek, Hebrew, Moldovan, Russian and Slovak. General education was provided in Bulgarian, Hungarian, Moldovan, Polish, Romanian, Russian, Slovak and Crimean Tatar. A total of 29 languages were studied as school subjects.

23. On the question of discrimination against African students in Kharkiv, especially at Kharkiv National Medical University, which had included verbal abuse, he said that it was important to remember that those were isolated incidents. Kharkiv had a large community of international students, including 3,500 at Kharkiv National Medical University. It was a strong community that included African and Asian nationals. Cooperation had been established with the police, the mayor's office and other public organizations, and events such as a festival of national cuisine had helped create an atmosphere of tolerance, and aimed to prevent incidents such as those mentioned. Thanks to Ukraine's renown as a centre of education for foreigners, especially in the field of medicine, its international student numbers had risen to over 69,000.

24. **Ms. Bohdanova** (Ukraine) in response to the question on protection mechanisms against discrimination in the area of employment, said that discriminatory vacancy notices were punishable by fines amounting to 10 times the minimum wage. Persons subjected to discrimination could appeal through the courts for the restoration of their rights and could receive compensation for moral or material damage. It was important that people had information that could protect them from discrimination, and for that purpose the Ministry of Social Policy had circulated a note on different forms of discrimination, containing the addresses of organizations that people could visit to discuss those problems. The Ministry was working to combat the stereotypes that led to discrimination, and to that end had developed a course module and a manual for representatives of the mass media and advertising industries. Those materials had been approved and were being distributed in higher education centres for journalists and advertising professionals. In 2012, the Ministry had improved its policies for considering complaints related to gender discrimination, and had set up an expert council on preventing discrimination, which was designed to provide expert analysis of complaints and discrimination based on gender, and to prepare recommendations on eliminating such violations.

25. With regard to the opportunities available to Crimean Tatars to preserve their cultural values in mainland Ukraine after the occupation of Crimea, she said that they lived in areas where the conditions had been created for them to meet their educational and cultural needs. Accordingly, the 2016 State budget had provided funding for cultural and artistic events and reconstruction work in the areas where Tatar populations live. Support was also being provided for television programmes, including the ATR television station, which provided objective information and broadcast in the occupied territories.

26. **Mr. Yurash** (Ukraine) said that he wished to answer some questions about the work of the Ministry of Culture. With regard to the question about the so-called Volyn tragedy that had occurred in 1943, he said that he realized that it was a painful but important subject. The parliament of Ukraine had already made several statements on the subject, and only

two months previously the President of Ukraine had visited Poland and knelt before the monument to the tragedy in Warsaw. Ukraine did not want to politicize the issue, but preferred to remember the tragedy while concentrating on positive cooperation with Poland, which was one of Ukraine's closest partners. The matter was usually raised by outside parties artificially.

27. On the question of the Russian ethnic group in the Transcarpathian region, he said that while there were identically named ethnic groups in the Czech Republic, Serbia and Slovakia, in fact they had different historical backgrounds and recent circumstances that had formed their contemporary identities. The Ukrainian State accepted the ethnic Russian identity as expressed by the people of that country. According to the 2001 census, 10,200 persons self-identified as Russians in the region, although an independent non-governmental organization put the figure at 20,000 to 30,000. That was equivalent to 1, 2, or 3 per cent of the region's population. In view of their low numbers and their dispersion across the Transcarpathian region, it was considered that they did not meet the 10 per cent threshold required to proclaim Russian as the regional language.

28. In response to the question of the 1991 referendum, he said that it had not borne any direct relation to the question of Russian identity, since it was purely concerned with matters of administrative and economic self-governance. Mention of that referendum in relation to the context of the Russian ethnicity was also artificial. Ukraine created ample opportunities for the cultural and scientific development of that population group.

29. In relation to the report on the website of the Ministry of Culture, several dozen comments had been received, 70 to 80 per cent of which had been included in the final version of the report submitted to the Committee. He expressed thanks to the Committee for raising the issue of the International Decade for People of African Descent. Ukraine would carefully study the matter and would create a special programme in response. With regard to the negative comments on the law underpinning State language policy, he said that he wished to assure the Committee members that the law was up to date in all aspects and was functioning well, despite differences of public opinion. Any amendments to the law would be made on the basis of continuing consultations with ethnic and national minorities and would take their views into account.

30. Ukraine had secured complete agreement among the Tatar community and society as a whole with regard to the importance of recognizing the Crimean Tatars as an indigenous group. To that end, six drafts had already been prepared of a bill that would be discussed in parliament in December 2016. The legislation would be important for securing the rights of the Crimean Tatar community, both in areas under government control and in the temporarily occupied Crimea, where 16 Crimean Tatars had disappeared and 11 had been killed in the past year.

31. On the question of some aspects of discrimination being promoted and advertised in the media, the Ministry was aware of the problem and was attempting to keep records and investigate cases. In the past several years, several dozen Russian-funded channels had been prohibited because of their openly discriminatory content.

32. Lastly, in respect of the question concerning religious conflicts, the expert council attached to the Ministry of Culture had prepared a special draft law to regulate that situation, which was already under parliamentary discussion. Ukrainian law allowed religious communities at the local level to freely change their affiliation, although no specific mechanisms were provided for making such changes. The new draft law aimed to allow communities to exercise that right, and would be an important addition to the existing system of regulation. The Government did not see that conflict as a general one between the patriarchates of Kyiv and Moscow, but was aware that there were tensions within local communities caused by the prospect of a change in affiliation.

33. **Mr. Yeung Sik Yuen** (Country Rapporteur) said that the Government did hold some responsibility for the deaths and injuries caused by the mines laid by rebels at the borders. The Government should, for example, reduce the waiting times at checkpoints and provide sanitary facilities so that people would not need to wander out into the fields in search of privacy.

34. Regarding the delegation's expressed wish to impose administrative rather than criminal sanctions for incitement to hatred in cases where it was not deliberate, he pointed out that article 161 of the Criminal Code referred specifically to wilful actions. He therefore urged the State party not to repeal that provision. The number of cases prosecuted for violations of article 161 seemed very low.

35. The police had a duty to act, even in the absence of a complaint by the victims, on the reports that the former mayor of Uzhgorod, who owned an aqua park, had denied entry to foreign students on the basis of their skin colour. The former mayor had allegedly made extremely racist comments, which had been reported in the media worldwide. He asked whether any complaints had been filed following the knife attacks targeting students from Jordan in Kharkov and whether the police had investigated that incident. He thanked the delegation for the additional information provided about the woman from Sierra Leone who had been thrown off a bus, and he commended the Government for the progress made with the education of Roma children.

36. Noting the appointment of Mustafa Dzhemilev as presidential commissioner for the affairs of Crimean Tatars, he asked whether Mr. Dzhemilev lived in Crimea or Ukraine. He imagined that Mr. Dzhemilev's life might be at risk if he lived in Crimea. He welcomed the efforts to initiate a programme of human rights training for police officers. The decrease in the number of complaints of hate crimes was not necessarily a positive sign. Rather, it might indicate that the victims of such crimes did not have faith in the system and thus believed that it would be pointless to file a complaint.

The meeting was suspended at 11.40 a.m. and resumed at 11.55 a.m.

37. *Ms. Crickley took the Chair.*

38. **Ms. Mazur** (Ukraine) thanked the Committee for taking note of her delegation's comments about the Minsk Protocol and the violations of that Protocol by armed groups supported by the Russian Federation. She reminded the Committee that Crimea was, in fact, part of Ukrainian territory. Mustafa Dzhemilev did reside in Crimea, although the occupying authorities were currently preventing him from returning there.

39. **Mr. Tarasenko** (Ukraine) said that Ukraine was not planning to repeal article 161 of the Criminal Code and that any of the actions described in that provision would be prosecuted. The issue at hand, rather, was that of providing indirect benefits or privileges on the basis of ethnicity or religion. For example, an employer might issue a job vacancy announcement requiring candidates to be former members of the Ukrainian armed forces, even though such a requirement was not necessary to perform the duties associated with the job. That requirement would effectively deny non-citizens the possibility of holding the job and would constitute a form of indirect discrimination. It was only in those types of situations that the Government planned to introduce administrative rather than criminal punishment.

40. Under national legislation, cases of discrimination could be prosecuted only on the basis of a complaint filed by the victim. His Government would look into that matter and try to find a way to ensure that the police were able to initiate investigations ex officio. The National Police of Ukraine had only recently been established, in November 2015, and was not yet operational in all cities. Soon, the Government would be in a position to focus on

reviewing police officers' credentials. Qualitative changes in police operations would become evident over time.

41. Regarding the incident at the aqua park in Uzhgorod, the students involved would need to file a complaint in order for investigations to be launched. The knife attacks in Kharkov were being criminally investigated, and discrimination was a main focus of those investigations.

42. **Mr. Marugán** asked what the overall trend had been since 2000 with regard to the school enrolment of Roma children. He also requested data on school attendance among other ethnic groups, along with information about measures taken to improve school attendance among the Roma.

43. With regard to the reduction in the number of complaints of hate crimes, he asked what steps the Government was taking to instil more trust in the police and in the legal system among victims of such crimes. He requested further information about how the prohibition on the broadcasting of messages inciting racial hatred was being implemented. He also requested information, including statistical data, on the implementation of labour laws prohibiting discrimination on the basis of national or ethnic origin in the workplace and in job vacancy announcements.

44. **The Chair** said that she wished to know more about measures taken to encourage school enrolment among the Roma, not just at the primary level but also at the secondary and tertiary levels. The Roma had been victims of discrimination in Ukraine long before the current conflicts in the country had begun. Expressing concern about reports of discrimination against Roma who had been forced to relocate because of the conflict, she asked what steps were being taken to combat such discrimination and to ensure the integration of the Roma in the communities where they relocated.

45. **Mr. Murillo Martínez** said that he welcomed the State party's willingness to adopt specific measures in connection with the International Decade for People of African Descent. He requested further information about special measures or affirmative action measures in Ukraine. He asked whether the burden of proof was reversed in the national legal system in cases of racial discrimination and, if not, whether the State party would consider implementing such a system. It would be useful to have an overview of the situation in Ukraine with respect to human trafficking, with a particular focus on cases involving minorities.

46. **Mr. Kononenko** (Ukraine) said that there had been a reduction since 2000 in the number of children who were not enrolled in school. The current figure of roughly 21,000 had not been broken down into groups of different nationalities or ethnicities. Each entry in the register included the child's permanent place of residence. As the Roma tended to change their place of residence quite frequently, it was quite possible that some cases of non-enrolment had not been included in the total. When officials were informed that new families had entered areas inhabited by the Roma, they should immediately register the children and ensure that they attended school.

47. Certain parents categorically refused to permit girls to continue their education at the post-primary levels. Social workers took vigorous action to prevent such conduct.

48. **Mr. Tarasenko** (Ukraine), referring to measures to combat crimes related to discrimination on grounds of nationality, race or ethnicity, said that the *militsiya* had attempted in the past to cover up many crimes and to produce impressively low crime statistics. The current aim was to register all complaints filed by citizens and foreign nationals. Severe penalties were imposed when officers failed to register complaints. The results of a survey conducted one month previously indicated that confidence in the police had risen to 46 per cent from the negative figure recorded 12 months earlier. Priority was

being given to reforms of the law enforcement system to ensure its effective and proper functioning.

49. With regard to the reversal of the burden of proof in the case of crimes with a discriminatory dimension, the system was currently based on the presumption of innocence and accused persons could not be required to present proof of their innocence. It was the duty of the prosecutor and the investigating judge to determine guilt or innocence in criminal proceedings in accordance with international standards.

50. **Ms. Bohdanova** (Ukraine) said that the Coordination and Expert Council on Social Policy reviewed facts related to discrimination at the Ministry of Social Policy. It had received 42 submissions, and 52 violations had been recorded. Discriminatory advertisements had been removed from 17 sites and fines had been imposed pursuant to the Advertising Act.

51. Statistical data on internally displaced persons (IDPs) did not include references to nationality. The following ratios had been recorded for different groups: older persons: 53 per cent; children: 13 per cent; persons with disabilities: 3.4 per cent; and employable persons: 29.7 per cent. The statistics also showed that 64 per cent of IDPs were women. Benefits included support for the payment of rent and assistance in finding employment. Two recent Cabinet decrees had simplified the registration process and ensured oversight of the payment of social benefits.

52. Many targeted anti-trafficking measures had recently been adopted. The Cabinet had adopted a National Social Programme on Combating Trafficking in Human Beings for the period until 2020 with a view to promoting cooperation between law enforcement agencies and social service providers. The Ministry of Social Policy and the Ministry of Internal Affairs had adopted a joint directive on the monitoring and collection of statistical data. The procedure for submitting complaints of trafficking had been amended and steps had been taken to ensure the confidentiality of the information. There were also plans to amend a number of laws with a view to making the fight against trafficking more effective and protecting victims. Steps were being taken to ensure that victims were properly identified in order to determine their status. Victim status had been accorded to 237 persons as of 11 August 2016, compared to 83 persons in 2015, a figure that was already 307 per cent higher than in 2014.

53. Posters highlighting the problem of trafficking had been displayed in many towns throughout the country. Information campaigns had been conducted to mark the International Day for the Abolition of Slavery, and a campaign to combat begging by children was being conducted in Odessa from 30 May until 2 September 2016. On the World Day against Trafficking in Persons in 2015, the Ministry of Social Policy, in collaboration with a coalition of NGOs, had conducted an anti-trafficking campaign in 15 Ukrainian cities.

54. **Mr. Yurash** (Ukraine), referring to the Strategy for the Protection and Integration of the Roma Ethnic Minority and its plan of action, said that the aim was to develop a specific strategy and action plan for each of the country's 25 regions. The Ministry of Social Policy was the top-level authority, but regional administrations would take into account the size of the Roma community in each area, existing possibilities, and how to support Roma who moved to their region following the troubles in the eastern part of the country.

55. **Ms. Mazur** (Ukraine) said that mass media sources were not prohibited on account of the language they used. They were prohibited only when they broadcast programmes involving individuals who threatened national security.

56. **Mr. Avtonomov** said that he failed to understand the decision of the Polish Parliament on 22 July 2016 to set 11 July as the national day of remembrance of victims of a massacre carried out by Ukrainian nationalists against Polish citizens in Volhynia and Eastern Galicia in German-occupied Poland during the Second World War. He wondered why a strategic partner of Ukraine should take such an unpleasant decision under the current circumstances.

57. He asked whether the State party was planning to establish interministerial and inter-agency bodies to promote the rights of minorities and to develop inter-ethnic relations.

58. **The Chair** requested further information concerning the decision to create an inter-ethnic harmony board attached to the Cabinet of Ministers.

59. **Mr. Amir** noted that the Roma considered that their community had 400,000 members in Ukraine and that NGOs estimated their number at 200,000. However, the authorities had issued identity papers to just 40,000 Roma. He asked why they had failed to issue a larger number of papers.

60. **Ms. Shepherd**, welcoming the State party's decision to adopt a plan of action for the International Decade for People of African Descent, reminded it that the Programme of Activities for the Decade required States to consult people of African descent on the content of such plans.

61. **Ms. Mazur** (Ukraine) said that the decision announced by the Polish Parliament was a controversial issue. Poland believed that genocide had been committed against the Polish people. Ukraine believed that the events had occurred in response to actions on the Polish side. In 2014 the President of Ukraine had nonetheless apologized to the Polish people. Mr. Avtonomov's question should therefore be raised with the Polish Parliament.

62. **Mr. Yurash** (Ukraine) said that his country had begun cooperating with international organizations on promoting the rights of minorities and developing inter-ethnic relations. Expert councils were also seeking information from NGOs and national communities based in Ukraine. During the current year 48 events had been held at the regional and national level involving direct consultations on issues of inter-ethnic harmony, mutual understanding and the updating of domestic legislation.

63. A 2001 survey had estimated the Roma community at 48,000. It had been based on Roma self-identification and the authorities had issued documents to the Roma on an annual basis since then. As there was no reference in Ukrainian passports to nationality, no clear information was available. However, the authorities were vigorously reviewing the situation in cooperation with Roma representatives and organizations of experts with a view to obtaining objective information.

64. **Mr. Tarasenko** (Ukraine) said that NGOs were encouraged to conduct surveys each year on the level of trust of the general public in the police force. The National Police had set up a group to investigate compliance with international human rights norms and their incorporation into domestic legislation. The group had agreed to request public organizations to submit information from independent sources on the National Police and respect for human rights. The information would be published in a bulletin.

65. **Mr. Yurash** (Ukraine) said that the plan of action for the International Decade for People of African Descent would be carefully studied together with representatives and organizations of people of African descent.

66. **Mr. Yeung Sik Yuen** commended the State party on its candid responses to all the questions raised.

67. **Ms. Mazur** (Ukraine) welcomed the constructive and enriching dialogue with the Committee. Ukraine was committed to taking further steps to eliminate all forms of racial discrimination, notwithstanding the tremendous challenges facing the country owing to the Russian aggression and the disruptive action by Russian-backed proxies. She assured the Committee that Ukraine would continue to introduce comprehensive human rights reforms and to ensure effective implementation of legislation in compliance with its international obligations. The Committee's concluding observations would be duly taken into account.

The meeting rose at 1 p.m.